

# **EXHIBIT E**

**United States District Court**  
**Western District of Michigan (Southern Division (1))**  
**CIVIL DOCKET FOR CASE #: 1:22-cv-00477-HYJ-RSK**

Taylor v. Belvoir Media Group, LLC

Assigned to: Chief Judge Hala Y. Jarbou

Referred to: Magistrate Judge Ray Kent (events as ordered)

Cause: 28:1332 Diversity-Fraud

Date Filed: 05/30/2022

Date Terminated: 09/14/2022

Jury Demand: Plaintiff

Nature of Suit: 370 Other Fraud

Jurisdiction: Diversity

**plaintiff**

**Jason Taylor**

*individually and on behalf of all others*

*similarly situated*

*also known as*

Jay Taylor

represented by **E. Powell Miller**

Miller Law Firm PC

950 W University Dr., Ste. 300

Rochester, MI 48307

(248) 841-2200

Email: epm@millerlawpc.com

*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Gregory A. Mitchell**

The Miller Law Firm PC

950 W University Dr., Ste. 300

Rochester, MI 48307

(248) 841-2200

Email: gam@millerlawpc.com

*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Joseph I. Marchese**

Bursor & Fisher, P.A. (NY)

1330 Avenue of the Americas, 32nd Fl.

New York, NY 10019

(646) 837-7410

Email: jmarchese@bursor.com

*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Philip L. Fraietta**

Bursor & Fisher, P.A. (NY)

1330 Avenue of the Americas, 32nd Fl.

New York, NY 10019

(646) 837-7150

Email: pfraietta@bursor.com

*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Sharon S. Almonrode**

The Miller Law Firm PC

950 W University Dr., Ste. 300

Rochester, MI 48307

(248) 746-0700  
Email: ssa@millerlawpc.com  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Frank S. Hedin**  
Hedin Hall LLP  
1395 Brickell Ave., Ste. 900  
Miami, FL 33131  
(305) 357-2107  
Email: fhedin@hedinhall.com  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**plaintiff**

**Mary Scott-Mooney**  
*individually and on behalf of all others  
similarly situated  
also known as  
Cathy Mooney*

represented by **Gregory A. Mitchell**  
(See above for address)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Joseph I. Marchese**  
(See above for address)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Philip L. Fraietta**  
(See above for address)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Sharon S. Almonrode**  
(See above for address)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**E. Powell Miller**  
(See above for address)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Frank S. Hedin**  
(See above for address)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**plaintiff**

**Ericka Killingbeck**  
*individually and on behalf of all others  
similarly situated*

represented by **Gregory A. Mitchell**  
(See above for address)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Joseph I. Marchese**  
(See above for address)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Philip L. Fraietta**  
(See above for address)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Sharon S. Almonrode**  
(See above for address)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**E. Powell Miller**  
(See above for address)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Frank S. Hedin**  
(See above for address)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**plaintiff**

**Francine Leggett**  
*individually and on behalf of all others  
similarly situated*

represented by **Gregory A. Mitchell**  
(See above for address)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Joseph I. Marchese**  
(See above for address)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Philip L. Fraietta**  
(See above for address)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Sharon S. Almonrode**  
(See above for address)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**E. Powell Miller**  
(See above for address)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Frank S. Hedin**  
(See above for address)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**plaintiff**

**Cheryl Lockhart**  
*individually and on behalf of all others  
similarly situated*

represented by **Gregory A. Mitchell**  
(See above for address)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Joseph I. Marchese**  
(See above for address)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Philip L. Fraietta**  
(See above for address)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Sharon S. Almonrode**  
(See above for address)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**E. Powell Miller**  
(See above for address)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Frank S. Hedin**  
(See above for address)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**plaintiff**

**Martha Lentz**  
*individually and on behalf of all others  
similarly situated*

represented by **Gregory A. Mitchell**  
(See above for address)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Joseph I. Marchese**  
(See above for address)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Philip L. Fraietta**  
(See above for address)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Sharon S. Almonrode**  
(See above for address)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**E. Powell Miller**  
(See above for address)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Frank S. Hedin**  
(See above for address)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

V.

**defendant**

**Belvoir Media Group, LLC**

represented by **Carol G. Schley**  
Clark Hill PLC (Birmingham)  
220 Park St., Ste. 200  
Birmingham, MI 48009-6103  
(248) 530-6338  
Fax: (248) 988-2312  
Email: [cschley@clarkhill.com](mailto:cschley@clarkhill.com)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Katelynn McCollough**  
Dentons Davis Brown PC  
215 10th St., Ste. 1300  
Des Moines, IA 50309  
(515) 288-2500  
Fax: (515) 243-0654  
Email: [katelynn.mccollough@dentons.com](mailto:katelynn.mccollough@dentons.com)  
*ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED*

**Kristen Rodriguez**  
Dentons US LLP (IL)  
233 S Wacker Dr., Ste. 7800

Chicago, IL 60606  
 (312) 876-6133  
 Email: kristen.rodriguez@dentons.com  
**ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED**

**Peter B. Kupelian**  
 Clark Hill PLC (Birmingham)  
 220 Park St., Ste. 200  
 Birmingham, MI 48009-6103  
 (248) 530-6336  
 Email: pkupelian@clarkhill.com  
**ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED**

Date Filed	#	Docket Text
05/30/2022	<a href="#">1</a>	COMPLAINT with jury demand against Belvoir Media Group, LLC filed by Jason Taylor (Attachments: # <a href="#">1</a> Index, # <a href="#">2</a> Exhibit A, # <a href="#">3</a> Exhibit B, # <a href="#">4</a> Exhibit C, # <a href="#">5</a> Exhibit D, # <a href="#">6</a> Exhibit E, # <a href="#">7</a> Exhibit F, # <a href="#">8</a> Exhibit G, # <a href="#">9</a> Exhibit H, # <a href="#">10</a> Exhibit I, # <a href="#">11</a> Exhibit J, # <a href="#">12</a> Exhibit K, # <a href="#">13</a> Exhibit L, # <a href="#">14</a> Exhibit M, # <a href="#">15</a> Exhibit N, # <a href="#">16</a> Exhibit O, # <a href="#">17</a> Exhibit P, # <a href="#">18</a> Exhibit Q) (Hedin, Frank) (Entered: 05/30/2022)
05/30/2022	<a href="#">2</a>	PROPOSED SUMMONS to be issued re <a href="#">1</a> (Hedin, Frank) (Entered: 05/30/2022)
05/30/2022		FILING FEE PAID re <a href="#">1</a> by plaintiff Jason Taylor in the amount of \$402, receipt number AMIWDC-6755776 (Hedin, Frank) (Entered: 05/30/2022)
05/31/2022	<a href="#">3</a>	(DISREGARD) SUMMONS ISSUED as to defendant Belvoir Media Group, LLC (slk) Modified text on 5/31/2022 - please see <a href="#">5</a> for corrected filing(slk). (Entered: 05/31/2022)
05/31/2022	<a href="#">4</a>	NOTICE that this case has been assigned Jane M. Beckering (slk) (Entered: 05/31/2022)
05/31/2022	<a href="#">5</a>	SUMMONS ISSUED as to defendant Belvoir Media Group, LLC (slk) (Entered: 05/31/2022)
05/31/2022		(NON-DOCUMENT) NOTICE that Summons Issued <a href="#">3</a> was filed in error and should be disregarded - please see <a href="#">5</a> for corrected summons (slk) (Entered: 05/31/2022)
06/01/2022		(NON-DOCUMENT) ATTORNEY APPEARANCE of Philip L. Fraietta on behalf of plaintiff Jason Taylor (Fraietta, Philip) (Entered: 06/01/2022)
06/01/2022		(NON-DOCUMENT) ATTORNEY APPEARANCE of E. Powell Miller on behalf of plaintiff Jason Taylor (Miller, E.) (Entered: 06/01/2022)
06/01/2022		(NON-DOCUMENT) ATTORNEY APPEARANCE of Sharon S. Almonrode on behalf of plaintiff Jason Taylor (Almonrode, Sharon) (Entered: 06/01/2022)
06/01/2022		(NON-DOCUMENT) ATTORNEY APPEARANCE of Gregory A. Mitchell on behalf of plaintiff Jason Taylor (Mitchell, Gregory) (Entered: 06/01/2022)
06/20/2022		(NON-DOCUMENT) ATTORNEY APPEARANCE of Peter B. Kupelian on behalf of defendant Belvoir Media Group, LLC (Kupelian, Peter) (Entered: 06/20/2022)
06/20/2022		(NON-DOCUMENT) ATTORNEY APPEARANCE of Carol G. Schley on behalf of defendant Belvoir Media Group, LLC (Schley, Carol) (Entered: 06/20/2022)
06/21/2022	<a href="#">6</a>	PROPOSED STIPULATION and ORDER <i>Extending Time for Defendant to Answer or Otherwise Respond to Plaintiff's Complaint</i> by defendant Belvoir Media Group, LLC (Schley, Carol) (Entered: 06/21/2022)

06/22/2022	<a href="#">7</a>	ORDER granting stipulated proposed order <a href="#">6</a> ; the deadline by which Defendant may file an answer or take any other action in response to Plaintiff's Complaint is extended through and includes 8/19/2022; signed by District Judge Jane M. Beckering (rmw) (Entered: 06/22/2022)
07/06/2022	<a href="#">8</a>	ADMINISTRATIVE ORDER No. 22-CA-055 that this case is reassigned to District Judge Hala Y. Jarbou and Magistrate Judge Ray Kent for all further proceedings ; signed by Chief Judge Robert J. Jonker (mg) (Entered: 07/06/2022)
07/07/2022		(NON-DOCUMENT) ATTORNEY APPEARANCE of Kristen Rodriguez on behalf of defendant Belvoir Media Group, LLC (Rodriguez, Kristen) (Entered: 07/07/2022)
07/08/2022	<a href="#">9</a>	ORDER TO SHOW CAUSE: Plaintiff to show cause or file amended complaint by 7/15/2022; signed by District Judge Hala Y. Jarbou (aks) (Entered: 07/08/2022)
07/08/2022	<a href="#">10</a>	NOTICE of status conference set for 7/19/2022 at 1:30 PM by video before District Judge Hala Y. Jarbou; (aks) (Entered: 07/08/2022)
07/08/2022	<a href="#">11</a>	(RESTRICTED ACCESS) DOCUMENT <i>Videoconference Information for 7/19/2022 hearing.</i> RECORDING OR BROADCASTING OF THIS PROCEEDING IS PROHIBITED. W.D. Mich. LGenR 4.1(c)(i) and (ii). [Access to this document is available to the Court and attorney(s) for Belvoir Media Group, LLC, Jason Taylor only] (aks) (Entered: 07/08/2022)
07/13/2022	<a href="#">12</a>	RESPONSE by plaintiff Jason Taylor to Order to Show Cause (Deadline) <a href="#">9</a> (Attachments: # <a href="#">1</a> Exhibit A) (Miller, E.) (Entered: 07/13/2022)
07/18/2022		(NON-DOCUMENT) ATTORNEY APPEARANCE of Joseph I. Marchese on behalf of plaintiff Jason Taylor (Marchese, Joseph) (Entered: 07/18/2022)
07/18/2022	<a href="#">13</a>	ORDER dismissing order to show cause <a href="#">9</a> ; signed by Chief Judge Hala Y. Jarbou (aks) (Entered: 07/18/2022)
07/19/2022	<a href="#">14</a>	MINUTES of status conference; held before Chief Judge Hala Y. Jarbou (Court Reporter: Genevieve Hamlin) (aks) (Entered: 07/20/2022)
07/23/2022	<a href="#">15</a>	FIRST AMENDED COMPLAINT against Belvoir Media Group, LLC filed by Jason Taylor, Mary Scott-Mooney, Ericka Killingbeck, Martha Lentz, Cheryl Lockhart, Francine Leggett (Attachments: # <a href="#">1</a> Index of Exhibits, # <a href="#">2</a> Exhibit A-BELVOIR MEDIA GROUP ELITE MASTERFILE Mailing List, # <a href="#">3</a> Exhibit B-Privacy: Sales, Rentals of Videos, etc., House Legislative Analysis Section, H.B. No. 5331, Jan. 20, 1989, # <a href="#">4</a> Exhibit C-The Information Marketplace: Merging and Exchanging Consumer Data (Mar. 13, 2001), # <a href="#">5</a> Exhibit D-Web's Hot New Commodity: Privacy, WSJ.com (Feb. 28, 2011), # <a href="#">6</a> Exhibit E-Statement of FTC Commissioner Pamela Jones Harbour (Dec. 7, 2009), # <a href="#">7</a> Exhibit F-Martha C. White, Big Data Knows What You're Doing Right Now, TIME.com (July 31, 2012), # <a href="#">8</a> Exhibit G-Natasha Singer, You for Sale: Mapping, and Sharing, the Consumer Genome, N.Y. Times (June 16, 2012), # <a href="#">9</a> Exhibit H-Letter from Senator John D. Rockefeller IV, Chairman, Senate Committee on Commerce, Science, and Transportation, to Scott E. Howe, Chief Executive Officer, Acxiom (Oct. 9, 2012), # <a href="#">10</a> Exhibit I-Bipartisan Group of Lawmakers Query Data Brokers About Practices Involving Consumers' Personal Information, Website of Senator Ed Markey (July 24, 2012), # <a href="#">11</a> Exhibit J-Prize Scams, Federal Trade Commission, # <a href="#">12</a> Exhibit K-Charles Duhigg, Bilking the Elderly, With a Corporate Assist, N.Y. Times, May 20, 2007, # <a href="#">13</a> Exhibit L-Fraud Against Seniors: Hearing before the Senate Special Committee on Aging (August 10, 2000), # <a href="#">14</a> Exhibit M-2014 TRUSTe US Consumer Confidence Privacy Report, TRUSTe, # <a href="#">15</a> Exhibit N-Joshua Brustein, Start-Ups Seek to Help Users Put a Price on Their Personal Data, N.Y. Times (Feb. 12, 2012), # <a href="#">16</a> Exhibit O-Tsai, Cranor, Acquisti, and Egelman, The Effect of Online Privacy Information on Purchasing Behavior, 22(2)

		Information Systems Research 254, 254 (2011), # <a href="#">17</a> Exhibit P-Hann, et al., The Value of Online Information Privacy: An Empirical Investigation (Oct. 2003), # <a href="#">18</a> Exhibit Q-California's Reader Privacy Act Signed into Law, Electronic Frontier Foundation (Oct. 3, 2011)) (Miller, E.) Modified text and filers on 7/25/2022 (ems). (Entered: 07/23/2022)
07/26/2022	<a href="#">16</a>	JOINT STATUS REPORT submitted for filing by plaintiffs Ericka Killingbeck, Francine Leggett, Martha Lentz, Cheryl Lockhart, Mary Scott-Mooney, Jason Taylor (Miller, E.) (Entered: 07/26/2022)
07/28/2022	<a href="#">17</a>	ORDER re status report <a href="#">16</a> ; setting status conference via video for 8/4/2022 at 10:00 AM; signed by Chief Judge Hala Y. Jarbou (aks) (Entered: 07/28/2022)
07/28/2022	<a href="#">18</a>	(RESTRICTED ACCESS) DOCUMENT <i>Videoconference Information for 8/4/2022 hearing</i> ; RECORDING OR BROADCASTING OF THIS PROCEEDING IS PROHIBITED. W.D. Mich. LGenR 4.1(c)(i) and (ii). [Access to this document is available to the Court and attorney(s) for Belvoir Media Group, LLC, Ericka Killingbeck, Francine Leggett, Martha Lentz, Cheryl Lockhart, Mary Scott-Mooney, Jason Taylor only] (aks) (Entered: 07/28/2022)
08/02/2022		(NON-DOCUMENT) ATTORNEY APPEARANCE of Katelynn McCollough on behalf of defendant Belvoir Media Group, LLC (McCollough, Katelynn) (Entered: 08/02/2022)
08/04/2022	<a href="#">19</a>	MINUTES of status conference; held before Chief Judge Hala Y. Jarbou (Court Reporter: Genevieve Hamlin) (aks) (Entered: 08/09/2022)
08/19/2022	<a href="#">20</a>	MOTION to dismiss ( <i>Defendant Belvoir Media Group, LLC's Motion to Dismiss Plaintiffs' Amended Complaint with Brief in Support</i> ) by defendant Belvoir Media Group, LLC; (Attachments: # <a href="#">1</a> Exhibit 1, # <a href="#">2</a> Exhibit 2, # <a href="#">3</a> Exhibit 3, # <a href="#">4</a> Exhibit 4) (Rodriguez, Kristen) (Entered: 08/19/2022)
08/19/2022	<a href="#">21</a>	CORPORATE DISCLOSURE STATEMENT by Belvoir Media Group, LLC (Rodriguez, Kristen) (Entered: 08/19/2022)
08/22/2022	<a href="#">22</a>	NOTICE to attorney Kristen Rodriguez regarding recent filing <a href="#">21</a> (ems) (Entered: 08/22/2022)
08/22/2022	<a href="#">23</a>	ORDER setting Rule 16 scheduling conference by telephone: telephone Rule 16 scheduling conference set for 9/22/2022 at 10:30 AM before Magistrate Judge Ray Kent; status report due by 9/19/2022; signed by Magistrate Judge Ray Kent (fhw) (Entered: 08/22/2022)
09/14/2022	<a href="#">24</a>	NOTICE OF VOLUNTARY DISMISSAL of case filed by plaintiffs Ericka Killingbeck, Francine Leggett, Martha Lentz, Cheryl Lockhart, Mary Scott-Mooney, Jason Taylor (Marchese, Joseph) (Entered: 09/14/2022)

<b>PACER Service Center</b>			
<b>Transaction Receipt</b>			
01/14/2024 19:22:41			
<b>PACER Login:</b>	DDB00200	<b>Client Code:</b>	
<b>Description:</b>	Docket Report	<b>Search Criteria:</b>	1:22-cv-00477-HYJ-RSK
<b>Billable Pages:</b>	8	<b>Cost:</b>	0.80